ACUTE TOXICITY OF SODIUM SELENITE AND SODIUM SELENATE TO TILAPIA, Oreochromis niloticus, FINGERLINGS

Maria José T. RANZANI-PAIVA 1*; Julio Vicente LOMBARDI 1; Adriano GONÇALVES 2

ABSTRACT

Selenium is an essential nutrient for many organisms, including fish. It can be released in the water by natural processes of dissolving rocks and minerals, and by the wastewater from industries and agricultural activities, which can increase its concentration in the environment, leading to toxic effects to the aquatic biota. Median Lethal Concentrations (LC_{50-96h}) of two forms of selenium were estimated to fingerlings of Nile tilapia *Oreochromis niloticus*, focusing on estimating indicators for future environmental risk assessments in aquatic ecosystems contaminated with those elements, particularly for evaluate sources of water quality suitable for rearing tilapia. The results were: LC_{50-96h} of sodium selenite (Na_2SeO_3) = 4.42 mg Se⁴⁺ L⁻¹, and LC_{50-96h} of sodium selenate (Na_2SeO_4) = 14,67 mg Se⁶⁺ L⁻¹. According to those data, it was possible to classify sodium selenite as highly toxic and sodium selenate as moderately toxic to fingerlings of tilapia.

Key words: Selenium; aquatic toxicology; fish; aquaculture

TOXICIDADE AGUDA DE SELENITO E SELENATO DE SÓDIO PARA ALEVINOS DE TILÁPIA, Oreochromis niloticus

RESUMO

O selênio é um nutriente essencial para muitos organismos. Este sal pode ser liberado na água por processos naturais, pela dissociação de rochas e minerais ou por restos de processos industriais e de atividades agrícolas, aumentando desta maneira sua concentração no ambiente, levando a efeitos tóxicos para a biota aquática. Concentrações Letais Medianas (CL_{50-96h}) de duas formas de selênio foram estimadas para alevinos de tilápia do Nilo, *Oreochromis niloticus*, com o intuito de estimar indicadores para futuras avaliações de risco ecotoxicológico em recursos hídricos contaminados com estes elementos, especialmente para avaliar as fontes de qualidade de água apropriadas para a tilapicultra. Os resultados obtidos foram: CL_{50-96h} de selenito de sódio (Na_2SeO_3) = 4,42 mg Se⁴⁺ L⁻¹, e CL_{50-96h} de selenato de sódio – (Na_2SeO_4) = 14,67 mg Se⁶⁺ L⁻¹. A partir desses valores foi possível classificar o selenito de sódio como altamente tóxico e o selenato de sódio como moderadamente tóxico para alevinos de tilápia.

Palavras chave: Selênio; toxicologia aquática; peixe; aquicultura

Nota Científica: Recebida em 26/07/2010 - Aprovada em 11/05/2011

¹ Scientific Researchers. Fisheries Institute. Av. Francisco Matarazzo, 455 – CEP: 05.001-900 - São Paulo – SP – Brazil. email: * mase@pesca.sp.gov.br (corresponding author); lombardi@uol.com.br

² CAUNESP-FCV/UNESP - Campus Jaboticabal. Via de acesso Paulo Donato Castellane, s/n – CEP: 14.884-900 – Jaboticabal – SP – Brazil. e-mail: agon73@yahoo.com.br

INTRODUCTION

Selenium in nature is released into water by the dissolving or oxidation of rocks and minerals in soluble salts, and it is an essential nutrient for many animal species, including fish. Selenium is a component of the enzyme glutathione peroxidase which protects cells and membranes (WATANABE et al., 1997, MONTEIRO, 2007). Industry utilizes selenium in the manufacture of pigments used in paints, dyes, glass, photoelectric cells, rectifier components, semi-conductors, medicines and insecticides (GUIMARÃES, 2010; MSPC, 2011). SWEE et al. (2002) comment that the increased levels of selenium in water due to industrial and agricultural runoff results in the contamination of aquatic ecosystems, which has noxious effects in fish. The most significant effect of excess Se in fish is the accumulation of Se in eggs and subsequent larval deformities (LEMLY, 1997; LEMLY, 2002; HOLM et al., 2005; MUSCATELLO et al., 2006). Other documented effects in fish include skin lesions, cataracts, swollen gill filament lamellae, myocarditis, and liver and kidney necrosis (LEMLY, 1997; LEMLY, 2002; LOHNER et al., 2001).

Since aquaculture depends on water resources, originating from phreatic aquifers, rivers and lakes, the presence of toxic quantities of selenium can cause harm to this commercial activity. In general, selenium is considered one of the most toxic mineral elements for fish, when present at high concentrations. According to SORENSEN (1991) the mortality induced by selenium varies with species, temperature, source of contamination, concentration, exposure time and chemical form. TAKAYANAGI (2001) and BIRUNGI et al. (2007) pointed out that different oxidation states of each chemical element can cause various effects in toxicity tests carried out with fish.

Acute toxicity tests are generally carried out in order to determine the Median Lethal Concentrations (LC_{50-96h}) of xenobiotics, focusing on estimating indicators for environmental risk assessments in aquatic ecosystems (LOMBARDI, 2004).

The aim of the present study was to determine the median lethal concentration $(LC_{50.96h})$ of selenium in the form of sodium selenite and

sodium selenate to tilapia fingerlings, *Oreochromis niloticus*, as a contribution for future environmental risk assessments, and particularly for evaluate sources of water quality suitable for rearing tilapia.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

The experiments were conducted in the Laboratory of Pathology of Aquatic Organisms, Fisheries Institute, São Paulo, Brazil, in a climatized environment (constant temperature of 25.8 ± 0.21 °C). Fingerlings of tilapia were purchased from commercial fish farms (mean weight of 0.41 \pm 0.12 g and mean length of 2.46 \pm 0.21 cm). They were acclimated initially for a period of 96 h, in aquaria of 60 L, at a density of 0.8 g fish L-1, in accordance with toxicity tests (APHA et al., 2005). During this period, fish were examined for possible diseases, presence of parasites or physical damage. Afterwards, they were kept for more 48 h in other aquaria, under the same laboratory conditions, where the tests would be conducted. During these periods, food was supplied in the form of commercial pellets with 38% crude protein.

Each assay was run in aquaria containing 5 L of dechlrorinated tap water, equipped with artificial aeration and covered internally with a transparent plastic bag. Ten fingerlings of tilapia were randomly distributed into each aquarium. The system utilized was the renewal test, where all test solutions, in their entire volume, were replaced every 24 h. The experiments were carried out for 96 hours of exposure time (APHA et al., 2005) at selenium (Se) concentrations of 1.0, 2.0, 4.0, 8.0 and 16.0 mg $L^{\text{-}1}$ prepared from a stock solution of 1000 mg L⁻¹ Se. There were three replicates for each concentration. Two forms of Se: sodium selenite Na₂SeO₃ (Se⁴⁺) and sodium selenate Na₂SeO₄ (Se⁶⁺) were tested separately in the same concentration range cited above. The control groups consisted of aquaria containing only dillution water, with no addition of selenium. The range of concentrations employed in this definitive test was previously tested through preliminary and explanatory tests, carried out with the same methodology described for this definitive assay. The physical and chemical variables of the water, including

temperature (°C), electrical conductivity (μ S.cm⁻¹), pH and dissolved oxygen (mg L⁻¹), were monitored two hours after the test beginning and every 24 h. At the end of the 96-h period, water samples were collected from the aquaria and analyzed for total hardness (mg CaCO₃ L⁻¹) and total ammonia (mg NH₄ L⁻¹), transformed to unionized ammonia (mg NH₃ L⁻¹) through the method recommended by Bower and Bidwell (1978) and adapted for this study. The analysis of water quality mentioned above were carried out according to standard methods (APHA *et al.*, 2005), and it was performed only for the lower, higher, and intermediate concentrations and control group as well.

After periods of 24, 48, 72 and 96 h, mortality was recorded and dead individuals were removed

from the tanks. The LC_{50-96h} was determined by the Trimmed Spearman Karber statistical method, and data set was adjusted for control mortality using Abbott's correction (HAMILTON *et al.*, 1977).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

No alterations were observed in the physical and chemical variables of the water utilized in the acute toxicity tests with tilapia fingerlings (Tables 1 and 2) that could have interfered in the determination LC₅₀. of the The water characteristics were all at levels within the range considered as ideal for fish maintenance (BOYD, 1982). Even the concentrations of unionized ammonia (0.031 to 0.076 mg L-1) were very below the level of 0.26 mg L⁻¹ considered by EL-SHAFAI et al. (2004) as lethal for tilapia.

Table 1. Physical and chemical variables of water in tests for acute toxicity of sodium selenite in *Oreochromis niloticus* fingerlings (Mean ± Standard Deviation)

Concentration (mg Se ⁴⁺ L ⁻¹)	Temperature (ºC)	Dissolved Oxygen (mg L ⁻¹)	pН	Conductivity (µS cm ⁻¹)	Unionized Ammonia (mgNH₃L-¹)	Hardness (mgCaCO ₃ L ⁻¹)
Control	26.0 ± 0.1	6.3 ± 0.2	7.4 ± 0.03	65.9 ± 2.5	0.031 ± 0.019	22.2 ± 0.9
1.0	26.0 ± 0.1	6.5 ± 0.2	7.5 ± 0.02	68.6 ± 1.2	0.032 ± 0.011	22.9 ± 0.9
4.0	26.0 ± 0.1	6.4 ± 0.1	7.6 ± 0.03	79.9 ± 0.9	0.051 ± 0.007	24.2 ± 2.3
16.0	26.0 ± 0.1	6.6 ± 0.1	7.8 ± 0.10	103.6 ± 3.5	0.076 ± 0.007	22.2 ± 1.1

Table 2. Physical and chemical variables of water in tests for acute toxicity of sodium selenate in *Oreochromis niloticus* fingerlings (Mean ± Standard Deviation)

Concentration (mg Se ⁶⁺ L ⁻¹)	Temperature (ºC)	Dissolved Oxygen (mg L ⁻¹)	рН	Conductivity (µS cm ⁻¹)	Unionized Ammonia (mg NH ₃ L ⁻¹)	Hardness (mg CaCO ₃ L ⁻¹)
Control	26.1 ± 0.1	6.4 ± 0.2	7.3 ± 0.01	65.6 ± 1.1	0.036 ± 0.006	22.2 ± 0.9
1.0	25.6 ± 0.1	6.5 ± 0.0	7.4 ± 0.01	69.8 ± 0.9	0.033 ± 0.002	22.2 ± 0.9
4.0	25.7 ± 0.1	6.5 ± 0.1	7.7 ± 0.02	81.2 ± 1.4	0.038 ± 0.007	22.2 ± 1.1
16.0	25.6 ± 0.0	6.6 ± 0.0	7.7 ± 0.01	119.7 ± 2.5	0.047 ± 0.004	23.5 ± 0.4

Since the beginning of the experiment it was observed that sodium selenite (Se⁴⁺) showed to be more toxic than sodium selenate (Se⁶⁺) (Tables 3 and 4). Some clinical signs of intoxication were observed in the fish in the first hours of exposure, mainly at the highest Se⁴⁺ concentration (16.0 mg L⁻¹), in which the animals showed rapid opercular movement, hyperactivity, darkening of the skin (melanosis), dyspnea and death. Similarly to the present study, MAUK and BROWN (1999) reported that in the first hours of exposure to sodium selenite, the pike-like freshwater perches *Stizostedion vitreum* juveniles showed a slight discoloration and spiraling and erratic swimming. GAIKWAD (1989) also observed rapid opercular movement in juveniles of the Cichlidae *Etroplus maculatus* submitted to 96h of acute toxicity, test with selenium.

In the major part of the experiments, the mortality rate of fingerlings increased with selenium concentration in the water (Tables 3 and 4). Se⁴⁺ at 16.0 mg L⁻¹ caused 100% mortality at 72 h. Similar effects of acute toxicity with tilapia were observed by FRANÇA *et al.* (2007) employing the same concentration of selenium from the present study, confirming the aspects of test-reproductivety and low interference of genetic variability over the sensitivity of this species for this compound.

Table 3. Cumulative mortality (%) of *Oreochromis niloticus* fingerlings in the acute toxicity test with sodium selenite (Se⁴⁺)

		Cumulative Mortality (%)											
Concentration (mg Se ⁴⁺ L ⁻¹)	Time (hours)												Means
	24			48			72			96			(96h)
Replicates	Α	В	С	Α	В	С	Α	В	С	Α	В	С	-
control	10	0	0	10	0	0	10	0	0	10	0	0	3,3
1.0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	30	10	13,3
2.0	0	0	0	0	20	0	0	20	0	0	20	0	6,6
4.0	0	0	0	10	0	0	30	20	0	60	40	40	46,6
8.0	0	0	0	80	30	0	90	80	50	90	90	70	83,3
16.0	50	50	70	70	90	90	100	100	100	100	100	100	100

Table 4. Cumulative mortality (%) of *Oreochromis niloticus* fingerlings in the acute toxicity test with sodium selenate (Se⁶⁺)

	Cumulative Mortality (%)											_ Means	
Concentration (mg Se ⁶⁺ L ⁻¹)	Time (hours)												
	24			48			72			96			(96h)
Replicates	Α	В	С	Α	В	С	Α	В	С	Α	В	С	_
control	10	0	0	10	0	0	10	0	0	20	0	0	6.6
1.0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	10	0	0	3.3
2.0	0	0	0	10	0	0	10	0	0	10	0	10	6.6
4.0	0	0	0	0	0	0	10	10	0	10	30	10	16.6
8.0	0	0	0	0	0	0	10	10	0	20	10	0	10.0
16.0	10	0	0	20	20	40	30	50	60	30	90	60	60.0

The Median Lethal Concentrations (LC_{50-96h}) estimated for Se⁴⁺ and Se⁶⁺ were, respectively, 4.42 mg L⁻¹ (with 3.71 – 5.26 mg L⁻¹ as 95% of confident limit), and 14.67 mg L⁻¹ (with 11.94 - 18.03 mg L⁻¹ as 95% of confident limits). These values are within the range of 1 to 35 mg L⁻¹ Se⁴⁺ determined by NIIMI and LAHAM (1976) to the zebra fish (*Danio rerio*). MILLER *et al.* (2007) reported that sodium

selenite (Se⁴⁺) were more toxic than sodium selenate (Se⁶⁺) in an experiment carried out with rainbow trout, *Oncorhynchus mykiss*. The same aspect was observed in the present study for tilapia. The LC_{50-96h} values were lower than 70.0 mg L⁻¹ Se⁴⁺ and similar to 10.6 mg L⁻¹ Se⁶⁺ found to *Pargus major* (TAKAYANAGI, 2001). Higher value of LC_{50-96h} to Se⁴⁺ (11.7 mg L⁻¹) was reported by MAUK and BROWN (1999) to juveniles of *Stizostedion vitreum*. Nevertheless, it may be attributed to the high hardness of the water used in that study (380 mg CaCO₃ L⁻¹) compared to the lower mean level of 22.86 mg L⁻¹ CaCO₃ observed in the present study. In the same way, the findings

of different LC_{50} values by other authors (Table 5) may be related to the different forms of selenium utilized in the respective studies, as well as the water quality, and the different species and organism sizes employed in the tests (TAKAYANAGI, 2001).

Table 5. LC_{50-96h} values for different species of fish exposed to sodium selenate (Na₂SeO₄) and sodium selenite (Na₂SeO₃)

References	Species	Na₂SeO ₃ (Se ⁴⁺)	Na ₂ SeO ₄ (Se ⁶⁺)	
Present study	Orechromis niloticus (fingerling)	4.4 mg L ⁻¹	14.7 mg L ⁻¹	
TAKAYANAGI (2001)	Pargus major (juvenile)	70.0 mg L-1	10.6 mg L-1	
MAUK and BROWN (1999)	Stizostedion vitreum	11.7 mg L-1		
HAMILTON and BUHL (1990)	Oncorhynchus kisutch	39.0 mg L ⁻¹	32.5 mg L ⁻¹	
US EPA (1987)	Morone saxatilis (juvenile)	85.8 mg L-1		
US EPA (1987)	<i>Cyrinodan variegatus</i> (juvenile)	8.3 mg L-1		
CARDWELL et al. (1976)	Pimefales promelares	2.9 mg L ⁻¹		
NIIMI and LAHAM (1976)	Danio rerio	1 to 35 mg L-1		
PALAWSKI et al. (1985)	Morone saxatilis (larvae)	9.8 mg L ⁻¹	1.6 mg L-1	

According to the Ecotoxicological categories stated by ZUCKER (1985), Se⁴⁺ would be classified as highly toxic, since its LC_{50-96h} (4.42 mg L⁻¹) was within the range of 0.1 - 1.0 mg L⁻¹. At the same way, Se⁶⁺ would be classified as moderately toxic, since its LC_{50-96h} (14.67 mg L⁻¹) was within the range of > 1.0 < 10.0 mg L⁻¹.

REFERENCES

- APHA; AWWA; WPCF 2005 Standard Methods for the Examination of Water and Wastewater. 21^a
 ed. APHA - American Public Health Association, AWWA - American Water Works Association, WPCF - Water Pollution Control Federation. Washington, D.C. 1085p.
- BIRUNGI, Z.; MASOLA, B.; ZARANYIKA, M.F.; NAIGAGA, I.; MARSHALL, B. 2007 Active biomonitoring of trace heavy metals using fish (*Oreochromis niloticus*) as bioindicator species. The case of Nakivubo wetland along Lake Victoria. *Physics and Chemistry of the Earth*, Amsterdam, Parts A/B/C, 32(15-18): 1350-1358.

- BOWER, C.E. and BIDWELL, J.P. 1978 Ionization of ammonia in seawater: effects of temperature, pH, and salinity. *Journal Fishery Research Board of Canada*, 35: 1012-1016.
- BOYD, C.E. 1982 Water quality management for pond fish culture. Elsevier Plublishing Company, Amsterdan. 662 p.
- CARDWELL, R.D.; FREMAN, D.G.; PAYNE, T.R.; WILBUR, D.J. 1976 Acute toxicity of selenium dioxide to freshwater fishes. Archives of Evironmental Contamination and Toxicology, New York, 4: 129-144.
- EL-SHAFAI, S.A.; EL GOHARY, F.A.; NASR, F.A.; VAN DER STEEN, N.P.; GIJZEN, H.J. 2004 Chronic ammonia toxicity to duckeed-fed tilapia (*Oreochromis niloticus*). *Aquaculture*, Amsterdan, 232: 117-127.
- FRANÇA, J.G.; LOMBARDI, J.V.; RANZANI-PAIVA, M.J.T.; CARVALHO, S. 2007 Toxicidade aguda do mercúrio, associado ao selênio, para alevinos de tilápia Oreochromis niloticus. Journal of the Brazilian Society of Ecotoxicology, Rio Grande, 2(3): 243-248.

- GAIKWAD, S.A. 1989 Acute toxicity of mercury, copper and selenium to the fish *Etroplus maculates*. *Evironmental Ecology*, Lancaster, *7*: 694-696.
- GUIMARÃES, J.A. 2010 Uso de selênio e vitamina e na proteção contra danos oxidativos sistêmicos em caprinos induzidos à insulação escrotal. Recife, 83p. (Dissertação de Mestrado em Medicina Veterinária. UFRP).
- HAMILTON, M.A. and BUHL, K.L. 1990 Acute toxicity of boron, molybdenum and selenium to fry of chinook slamon and coho salmon. *Archives of Evironmental Contamination and Toxicology*, New York, 19: 366-373.
- HAMILTON, M.A.; RUSSO, R.C.; THURSTON, R.V. 1977 Trimmed Spearman-Karber method for estimating median lethal concentrations in toxicity bioassays. *Environmental Science Technology*, Iowa City, 11: 714-719.
- HOLM, J.; PALACE, V.; SIWIK, P.; STERLING, G.; EVANS, R.; BARON, C.; WEERNER, J.; WAUTIER, K. 2005 Developmental effects of bioaccumulated selenium in eggs and larvae of two salmonid species. *Environmental Toxicology Chemistry*, Weinheim, 24: 2373–2381.
- LEMLY, A.D. 1997 A teratogenic deformity index for evaluating impacts of selenium on fish populations. *Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safe*, Amsterdan, 37: 259–266.
- LEMLY, A.D. 2002 Symptoms and implications of selenium toxicity in fish: the Belews Lake case example. *Aquatic Toxicology*, Amsterdan, 57: 39–49.
- LOHNER, T.W.; REASH, R.J.; WILLET, V.E.; ROSE, L.A. 2001 Assessment of tolerant sunfish populations (*Lepomis* sp.) inhabiting seleniumladen coal ash effluents 1. Hematological and population level assessment. *Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safe*, Amsterdan, 50: 203–216.
- LOMBARDI, J.V. 2004 Fundamentos de Toxicologia Aquática. In: RANZANI-PAIVA, M.J.T.; TAKEMOTO, R.M.; LIZAMA, M.A.P. (Eds.) Sanidade de organismos aquáticos. Ed. Varella, São Paulo. p.263-272.
- MAUK, R.J. and BROWN, M.L. 1999 Acute toxicity of sodium selenite to juvenile walleye. *Bulletin of Evironmental Contamination Toxicology*, New York, 63: 188-194.

- MILLER, L.L.; WANG, F.; PALACE, V.P.; HONTELA, A. 2007 Effects of acute and subchronic exposures to waterborne selenite on the physiological stress response and oxidative stress indicators in juvenile rainbow trout. *Aquatic Toxicology*, Amsterdan, *83*: 263-271.
- MONTEIRO, D.A.; RANTIN, F.T.; KALININ, A.L. 2007 Uso do selênio na dieta de matrinxã, *Brycon cephalus. Revista Brasileira de Saúde e Produção Animal*, 8(1): 32-47.
- MSPC Informações Técnicas 2011 Available at: http://www.mspc.eng.br/quim1/quim1_034. asp> Access on: 21/mar./2011.
- MUSCATELLO, J.R.; BENNETT, P.M.; HIMBEAULT, K.T.; BELKNAP, A.M.; JANZ, D.M. 2006 Larval deformities associated with selenium accumulation in northern pike (*Esox lucius*) exposed to metal mining effluent. *Environmental Science Technology*, Iowa City, 40: 6506–6512.
- NIIMI, A.J. and LAHAM, Q.N. 1976 Relative toxicity of organic and inorganic compounds of selenium to newly hatched zebrafish (*Brachydanio rerio*). Canadian Journal of Zoology, Toronto, 54: 501-509.
- PALAWSKI, D.; HUNN, J.B.; DWYER, F.J. 1985 Sensitivity of young striped bass to organic and inorganic contaminants in fresh and saline waters. *Transactions of the American Fisheries Society*, Washington, 114: 748-753.
- SORENSEN, E.M.B. 1991 *Metal poisoning in fish.* Florida: CRC Press. 361p.
- SPRAGUE, J.B. 1971 Measuremnent of pollutant toxiciy to fish. III. Sublethal effects and safe concentrations. *Water Research*, Amsterdan, 3: 793-821.
- SWEE, J.T.; XIN, D.; FOO-CHING, T.; SILAS, O.H. 2002 Selenium-induced teratogenicity in Sacramento splittail (*Pogonichthys* macrolepidotus). Marine Environmental Research, Little River, 54: 605-608.
- TAKAYANAGI, K. 2001 Acute toxicity of waterbone Se (IV), e Se (VI), Sb (III), and Sb (V) on red seabream (*Pargus major*). Bulletin of Evironmental Contamination and Toxicology, New York, 66: 808-813.

- US EPA 1987 Ambient Water Quality Criteria for Selenium. EPA 440/5-87/083, National Technical Information Service, Springfield, VA. 128p.
- WATANABE, T.; KIRON, V.; SATOH, S. 1997 Trace minerals in fish nutrition. *Aquaculture*, Amsterdam, *151*: 185-207.
- ZUCKER, E. 1985 Hazard Evaluation Division, Standard Evaluation Procedure: Acute Toxicity Test for Freshwater Fish. Washington, DC: US Environmental Protection Agency Office of Pesticide Programs. PB86-129277. EPA-540/9-85-006.